

PAYNE & FEARS LLP

ATTORNEYS AT LAW
4 PARK PLAZA, SUITE 1100
IRVINE, CALIFORNIA 92614
(949) 851-1100

Daniel F. Fears, State Bar No. 110573
dff@paynefears.com
Andrew K. Haeffele, State Bar No. 258992
akh@paynefears.com
Bree A. Oswald, State Bar No. 314614
bao@paynefears.com
PAYNE & FEARS LLP
Attorneys at Law
4 Park Plaza, Suite 1100
Irvine, California 92614
Telephone: (949) 851-1100
Facsimile: (949) 851-1212

Attorneys for WAL-MART
ASSOCIATES, INC.

Sam K. Kim, State Bar No. 258467
skim@verumlg.com
Yoonis J. Han, State Bar No. 256151
yhan@verumlg.com
VERUM LAW GROUP, APC
360 N. Pacific Coast Highway, Suite 1025
El Segundo, California 90245
Tel: (424) 320-2000
Fax: (424) 221-5010

Attorneys for Plaintiff YOUNG K. CHOI

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA, SOUTHERN DIVISION**

YOUNG K. CHOI, an individual,

Plaintiff,

v.

WAL-MART ASSOCIATES, INC., a
Delaware corporation; and DOES 1
through 10, inclusive,

Defendant.

Case No. 8:23-cv-02376 CJC (KESx)

**STIPULATED PROTECTIVE
ORDER**

Action Filed: November 2, 2023
Trial Date: None Set

1. GENERAL

1.1 Purposes and Limitations. Discovery in this action is likely to involve production of confidential, proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting

1 this litigation may be warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and
2 petition the Court to enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties
3 acknowledge that this Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or
4 responses to discovery and that the protection it affords from public disclosure and
5 use extends only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential
6 treatment under the applicable legal principles. The parties further acknowledge, as
7 set forth in Section 12.3, below, that this Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle
8 them to file confidential information under seal; Civil Local Rule 79-5 sets forth the
9 procedures that must be followed and the standards that will be applied when a party
10 seeks permission from the court to file material under seal.

11 1.2 Good Cause Statement.

12 This action is likely to involve trade secrets, customer and pricing lists and
13 other valuable research, development, commercial, financial, technical and/or
14 proprietary information for which special protection from public disclosure and from
15 use for any purpose other than prosecution of this action is warranted. Such
16 confidential and proprietary materials and information consist of, among other things,
17 confidential business or financial information, information regarding confidential
18 business practices, or other confidential research, development, or commercial
19 information (including information implicating privacy rights of third parties),
20 information otherwise generally unavailable to the public, or which may be privileged
21 or otherwise protected from disclosure under state or federal statutes, court rules, case
22 decisions, or common law.

23 The matter may also include private, protected data, which shall refer to any
24 information that a party believes in good faith to be subject to federal, state or foreign
25 data protection laws or other privacy obligations. Examples of such data protection
26 laws include but are not limited to The Gramm-Leach-Bliley Act, 15 U.S.C. § 6801
27 et seq. (financial information); and, The Health Insurance Portability and
28 Accountability Act and the regulations thereunder, 45 CFR Part 160 and Subparts A

1 and E of Part 164 (medical information).

2 Accordingly, to expedite the flow of information, to facilitate the prompt
3 resolution of disputes over confidentiality of discovery materials, to adequately
4 protect information the parties are entitled to keep confidential, to ensure that the
5 parties are permitted reasonable necessary uses of such material in preparation for and
6 in the conduct of trial, to address their handling at the end of the litigation, and serve
7 the ends of justice, a protective order for such information is justified in this matter.
8 It is the intent of the parties that information will not be designated as confidential for
9 tactical reasons and that nothing be so designated without a good faith belief that it
10 has been maintained in a confidential, non-public manner, and there is good cause
11 why it should not be part of the public record of this case.

12 **2. DEFINITIONS**

13 2.1 Action: Young Choi v. Walmart Inc., Case No.
14 8:23-cv-02376-CJC-KES

15 2.2 Challenging Party: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation
16 of information or items under this Order.

17 2.3 “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items: information (regardless of
18 how it is generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection
19 under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c), and as specified above in the Good
20 Cause Statement.

21 2.4 Counsel: Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as well as their
22 support staff).

23 2.5 Designating Party: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or
24 items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as
25 “CONFIDENTIAL.”

26 2.6 Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless
27 of the medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including,
28

1 among other things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced or
2 generated in disclosures or responses to discovery in this matter.

3 2.7 Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter
4 pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as
5 an expert witness or as a consultant in this Action.

6 2.8 House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a party to this Action.
7 House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside
8 counsel.

9 2.9 Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association, or
10 other legal entity not named as a Party to this action.

11 2.10 Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a party
12 to this Action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this Action and have
13 appeared in this Action on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm that
14 has appeared on behalf of that party, including support staff.

15 2.11 Party: any party to this Action, including all of its officers, directors,
16 employees, consultants, retained experts, agents, and Outside Counsel of Record (and
17 their support staffs).

18 2.12 Producing Party: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or
19 Discovery Material in this Action.

20 2.13 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation support
21 services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or
22 demonstrations, and organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium)
23 and their employees and subcontractors.

24 2.14 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is
25 designated as "CONFIDENTIAL."

26 2.15 Receiving Party: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material
27 from a Producing Party.

28 ///

3. SCOPE

The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only Protected Material (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or extracted from Protected Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any testimony, conversations, or presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material.

Any use of Protected Material at trial shall be governed by the orders of the trial judge. This Order does not govern the use of Protected Material at trial.

4. DURATION

Once a case proceeds to trial, all of the court-filed information to be introduced that was previously designated as confidential or maintained pursuant to this protective order becomes public and will be presumptively available to all members of the public, including the press, unless compelling reasons supported by specific factual findings to proceed otherwise are made to the trial judge in advance of the trial. See Kamakana v. City and Cty. of Honolulu, 447 F.3d 1172, 1180-81 (9th Cir. 2006) (distinguishing “good cause” showing for sealing documents produced in discovery from “compelling reasons” standard when merits-related documents are part of court record). Accordingly, the terms of this protective order do not extend beyond the commencement of the trial.

5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL**5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection.**

Each Party or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under this Order must take care to limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies under the appropriate standards. The Designating Party must designate for protection only those parts of material, documents, items, or oral or written communications that qualify so that other portions of the material, documents, items, or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept unjustifiably within the ambit of this Order.

1 Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations
2 that are shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper
3 purpose (e.g., to unnecessarily encumber the case development process or to impose
4 unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Designating Party
5 to sanctions.

6 If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that it
7 designated for protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must
8 promptly notify all other Parties that it is withdrawing the inapplicable designation.

9 5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in
10 this Order (see, e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise
11 stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection
12 under this Order must be clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or
13 produced.

14 Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

15 (a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic
16 documents, but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial
17 proceedings), that the Producing Party affix, at a minimum, the legend
18 "CONFIDENTIAL" (hereinafter "CONFIDENTIAL legend"), to each page that
19 contains protected material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page
20 qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected
21 portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

22 A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents available for inspection
23 need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated
24 which documents it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and
25 before the designation, all of the material made available for inspection shall be
26 deemed "CONFIDENTIAL." After the inspecting Party has identified the documents
27 it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine which documents,
28 or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order. Then, before producing

1 the specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the “CONFIDENTIAL
2 legend” to each page that contains Protected Material. If only a portion or portions
3 of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly
4 identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the
5 margins).

6 (b) for testimony given in depositions that the Designating Party identify
7 the Disclosure or Discovery Material on the record, before the close of the deposition.

8 (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary and
9 for any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on
10 the exterior of the container or containers in which the information is stored the legend
11 “CONFIDENTIAL.” If only a portion or portions of the information warrants
12 protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the protected
13 portion(s).

14 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent
15 failure to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the
16 Designating Party’s right to secure protection under this Order for such material.
17 Upon timely correction of a designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable
18 efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the provisions of this
19 Order.

20 **6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS**

21 6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a
22 designation of confidentiality at any time that is consistent with the Court’s
23 Scheduling Order.

24 6.2 Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute
25 resolution process under Local Rule 37-1, et seq. Any discovery motion must strictly
26 comply with the procedures set forth in Local Rules 37-1, 37-2, and 37-3.

27 6.3 Burden. The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding
28 shall be on the Designating Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an

improper purpose (e.g., to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Challenging Party to sanctions. Unless the Designating Party has waived or withdrawn the confidentiality designation, all parties shall continue to afford the material in question the level of protection to which it is entitled under the Producing Party's designation until the Court rules on the challenge.

7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

7.1 Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is disclosed or produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this Action only for prosecuting, defending, or attempting to settle this Action. Such Protected Material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the conditions described in this Order. When the Action has been terminated, a Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of section 13 below (FINAL DISPOSITION).

Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons authorized under this Order.

7.2 Disclosure of "CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items. Unless otherwise ordered by the Court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated "CONFIDENTIAL" only to:

(a) the Receiving Party's Outside Counsel of Record in this Action, as well as employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the information for this Action;

(b) the officers, directors, agents, and employees (including House Counsel) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action;

(c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A);

(d) the Court and its personnel;
 (e) court reporters and their staff;
 (f) professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and Professional Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

(g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information;

(h) during their depositions, witnesses, and attorneys for witnesses, in the Action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary provided: (1) the deposing party requests that the witness sign the form attached as Exhibit A hereto; and (2) they will not be permitted to keep any confidential information unless they sign the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A), unless otherwise agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the Court. Pages of transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material may be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order; and

(i) any mediator or settlement officer, and their supporting personnel, mutually agreed upon by any of the parties engaged in settlement discussions.

8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN OTHER LITIGATION

If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this Action as “CONFIDENTIAL,” that Party must:

(a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification shall include a copy of the subpoena or court order;

(b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena

1 or order is subject to this Protective Order. Such notification shall include a copy of
2 this Stipulated Protective Order; and

3 (c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued
4 by the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

5 If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with
6 the subpoena or court order shall not produce any information designated in this action
7 as “CONFIDENTIAL” before a determination by the court from which the subpoena
8 or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party’s permission. The
9 Designating Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in that court
10 of its confidential material and nothing in these provisions should be construed as
11 authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this Action to disobey a lawful
12 directive from another court.

13 **9. A NON-PARTY’S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE**
14 **PRODUCED IN THIS LITIGATION**

15 (a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a Non-
16 Party in this Action and designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.” Such information
17 produced by Non-Parties in connection with this litigation is protected by the
18 remedies and relief provided by this Order. Nothing in these provisions should be
19 construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional protections.

20 (b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to produce
21 a Non-Party’s confidential information in its possession, and the Party is subject to an
22 agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party’s confidential
23 information, then the Party shall:

24 (1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party
25 that some or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality agreement
26 with a Non-Party;
27
28

(2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated Protective Order in this Action, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably specific description of the information requested; and

(3) make the information requested available for inspection by the Non-Party, if requested.

(c) If the Non-Party fails to seek a protective order from this Court within 14 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party may produce the Non-Party's confidential information responsive to the discovery request. If the Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party shall not produce any information in its possession or control that is subject to the confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a determination by the Court. Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in this Court of its Protected Material.

10. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this Stipulated Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (c) inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this Order, and (d) request such person or persons to execute the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

11. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE PROTECTED MATERIAL

When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection, the obligations of the Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure

1 may be established in an e-discovery order that provides for production without prior
2 privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d) and (e), insofar as the
3 parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a communication or
4 information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work product protection, the
5 parties may incorporate their agreement in the stipulated protective order submitted
6 to the Court.

7 **12. MISCELLANEOUS**

8 12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any
9 person to seek its modification by the Court in the future.

10 12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this
11 Protective Order, no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to
12 disclosing or producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in this
13 Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on any
14 ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Protective Order.

15 12.3 Filing Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any
16 Protected Material must comply with Civil Local Rule 79-5. Protected Material may
17 only be filed under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the specific
18 Protected Material at issue; good cause must be shown in the request to file under
19 seal. If a Party's request to file Protected Material under seal is denied by the Court,
20 then the Receiving Party may file the information in the public record unless
21 otherwise instructed by the Court.

22 **13. FINAL DISPOSITION**

23 After the final disposition of this Action, within 60 days of a written request by
24 the Designating Party, each Receiving Party must return all Protected Material to the
25 Producing Party or destroy such material. As used in this subdivision, "all Protected
26 Material" includes all copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries, and any other
27 format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material. Whether the Protected
28 Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving Party must submit a written

PAYNE & FEARS LLP

ATTORNEYS AT LAW
4 PARK PLAZA, SUITE 1100
IRVINE, CALIFORNIA 92614
(949) 851-1100

1 certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same person or entity, to the
2 Designating Party) by the 60 day deadline that (1) identifies (by category, where
3 appropriate) all the Protected Material that was returned or destroyed, and (2) affirms
4 that the Receiving Party has not retained any copies, abstracts, compilations,
5 summaries or any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material.
6 Notwithstanding this provision, counsel are entitled to retain an archival copy of all
7 pleadings, motion papers, trial, deposition, and hearing transcripts, legal memoranda,
8 correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney work product,
9 and consultant and expert work product, even if such materials contain Protected
10 Material. Any such archival copies that contain or constitute Protected Material
11 remain subject to this Protective Order as set forth in Section 4 (DURATION).

12 //

13 //

14 //

15 //

16 //

17 //

18 //

19 //

20 //

21 //

22 //

23 //

24 //

25 //

26 //

27 //

28 //

1 **14. VIOLATION OF ORDER**

2 Any violation of this Order may be punished by any and all appropriate
3 measures including, without limitation, contempt proceedings and/or monetary
4 sanctions.

5
6 IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.

7
8 VERUM LAW GROUP, APC

9
10 DATED: March 12, 2024

By: /s/Sam K. Kim

11 SAM K. KIM

12 YOONIS J. HAN

Attorneys for Plaintiff YOUNG K. CHOI

13 DATED: March 12, 2024

PAYNE & FEARS LLP

14
15
16 By: /s/ Andrew K. Haeffele

17 DANIEL F. FEARS

18 ANDREW K. HAEFFELE

BREE A. OSWALD

19 Attorneys for WAL-MART
20 ASSOCIATES, INC.

21
22 FOR GOOD CAUSE SHOWN, IT IS SO ORDERED.

23
24 DATED: March 13, 2024

Karen E. Scott

25 HON. KAREN E. SCOTT
26 United States Magistrate Judge
27
28

EXHIBIT AACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

I, _____ [full name], of _____ [full address], declare under penalty of perjury that I have read in its entirety and understand the Stipulated Protective Order that was issued by the United States District Court for the Central District of California on _____ [date] in the case of _____ [insert case name and number]. I agree to comply with and to be bound by all the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order and I understand and acknowledge that failure to so comply could expose me to sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt. I solemnly promise that I will not disclose in any manner any information or item that is subject to this Stipulated Protective Order to any person or entity except in strict compliance with the provisions of this Order.

I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court for the Central District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after termination of this action. I hereby appoint _____ [full name] of _____ [full address and telephone number] as my California agent for service of process in connection with this action or any proceedings related to enforcement of this Stipulated Protective Order.

Date: _____

City and State where signed: _____

Printed name: _____

Signature: _____